



## AGENDA ITEM EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Title:	Recommendation to Award Bid for the Red Gate Bridge Advanced Work and Approve Contract
--------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Presenter:	James Bernahl
------------	---------------

*Please check appropriate box:*

<input type="checkbox"/> Government Operations	<input type="checkbox"/> Government Services
------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------

<input type="checkbox"/> Planning & Development	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> City Council – 06-05-11
-------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------

Estimated Cost:	\$1,651,718.23
-----------------	----------------

Budgeted:	YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> X	NO
-----------	-----	---------------------------------------	----

If NO, please explain how item will be funded:

### Executive Summary:

On June 28, 2011 at 10:00 AM, sealed bids for the Red Gate Bridge Advanced Contract were publicly opened and read aloud. The results of the bid opening are as follows:

Engineer's Estimate: \$2,739,317.50

1. Herlihy Mid-Continent Co.	\$1,651,718.23
2. James McHugh Construction	\$1,996,690.09
3. Lake County grading Co.	\$ 2,000,750.00
4. IHC Construction Co.	\$ 2,024,011.84
5. Illinois Constructors	\$ 2,265,127.64
6. Sjostrom & Sons	\$ 2,288,882.04
7. EarthWerks	\$ 2,944,854.24

The scope of work will include mass earthwork, tree removal, installation of pedestrian underpass bridge for the existing bike path on the east side of the Fox River, earthwork trucking, and detention pond installation. All proposed work is considered preemptive work for the construction of the Red Gate Bridge and Roadway. In addition to the roadway and bridge installation proposed earthwork and tree removals will assist in preparing the landscaping for the new proposed pedestrian and bicycle pathway to be installed as part of the next phase on construction.

Based on the size of this project staff will be utilizing the services of Alfred Benesch & Company to perform the Construction Observation services for this project.

### Attachments: *(please list)*

- Copy of the Bid Results
- Contract Bid Review from Alfred Benesch & Company

### Recommendation / Suggested Action *(briefly explain)*:

**Staff recommends awarding contract for the Red Gate Advanced Contract to Herlihy Mid-Continent Co. for an amount not to exceed \$1,651,718.23.**

*For office use only:*

*Agenda Item Number:* IB

**City of St. Charles, Illinois**  
**Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_**

**A Resolution Approving the Execution of a Contract from Herlihy Mid-Continent Company for the Red Gate Bridge advanced work**

**Presented & Passed by the  
City Council on July 5, 2011**

BE IT RESOLVED by the Mayor and City Council of the City of St. Charles, Kane and DuPage Counties, Illinois, that the Mayor and City Clerk be and the same are hereby authorized to execute a Contract from Herlihy Mid-Continent Company for the Red Gate Bridge advanced work at a cost not to exceed \$1,651,718.23.

PRESENTED to the City Council of the City of St. Charles, Illinois, this 5th day of July 2011.

PASSED by the City Council of the City of St. Charles, Illinois, this 5th day of July 2011.

APPROVED by the Mayor of the City of St. Charles, Illinois, this 5th day of July 2011.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Donald P. DeWitte, Mayor

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
City Clerk

COUNCIL VOTE:

Ayes:

Nays:

Absent:

Abstain:

# THE CITY OF ST. CHARLES - Bid Tabulation Report - Comparison with Engineer's Estimate

Project Description: RED GATE ROAD EXTENSION OVER THE FOX RIVER - ADVANCE CONTRACT

Bid Open Date: 6/23/2011

Begin Date: TBD

End Date: 10/31/2011

				Herlthy Mid-Continent Co.			James McHugh Construction			Lake County Grading Co.		
Item	Description	Unit	Quantity	Bidder 1 Auth Price	Amount		Bidder 2 Auth Price	Amount		Bidder 3 Auth Price	Amount	
20100500	TREE REMOVAL, ACRES	ACRE	4.3	\$3,800.00	\$16,340.00		\$4,500.00	\$19,350.00		\$7,500.00	\$32,250.00	
20101000	TEMPORARY FENCE	FOOT	5,500	\$2.20	\$12,100.00		\$3.25	\$17,875.00		\$3.50	\$19,250.00	
20101100	TREE TRUNK PROTECTION	EACH	100	\$45.00	\$4,500.00		\$75.00	\$7,500.00		\$150.00	\$15,000.00	
20101300	TREE PRUNING (1 TO 10 INCH DIAMETER)	EACH	100	\$35.00	\$3,500.00		\$65.00	\$6,500.00		\$43.00	\$4,300.00	
20101350	TREE PRUNING (OVER 10 INCH DIAMETER)	EACH	100	\$75.00	\$7,500.00		\$90.00	\$9,000.00		\$75.00	\$7,500.00	
20200100	EARTH EXCAVATION	CU YD	16,188	\$3.00	\$48,564.00		\$10.50	\$169,974.00		\$4.50	\$72,846.00	
20400800	FURNISHED EXCAVATION	CU YD	59,621	\$7.99	\$476,371.79		\$10.65	\$634,963.65		\$9.00	\$536,589.00	
20700400	POROUS GRANULAR EMBANKMENT, SPECIAL	CU YD	298	\$35.00	\$10,430.00		\$30.00	\$8,940.00		\$48.00	\$14,304.00	
20800150	TRENCH BACKFILL	CU YD	39	\$35.00	\$1,365.00		\$40.00	\$1,560.00		\$25.00	\$975.00	
21101505	TOPSOIL EXCAVATION AND PLACEMENT	CU YD	10,402	\$5.92	\$61,579.84		\$13.00	\$135,226.00		\$9.90	\$102,979.80	
25000110	SEEDING, CLASS 1A	ACRE	0.2	\$3,000.00	\$600.00		\$1,200.00	\$240.00		\$3,100.00	\$620.00	
25000210	SEEDING, CLASS 2A	ACRE	8.6	\$775.00	\$6,665.00		\$1,200.00	\$10,320.00		\$900.00	\$7,740.00	
25000300	SEEDING, CLASS 3	ACRE	1.4	\$1,500.00	\$2,100.00		\$1,987.00	\$2,781.80		\$1,600.00	\$2,240.00	
25000400	NITROGEN FERTILIZER NUTRIENT	POUND	918	\$2.00	\$1,836.00		\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$2.00	\$1,836.00	
25000500	PHOSPHORUS FERTILIZER NUTRIENT	POUND	918	\$2.00	\$1,836.00		\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$2.00	\$1,836.00	
25000600	POTASSIUM FERTILIZER NUTRIENT	POUND	918	\$2.00	\$1,836.00		\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$2.00	\$1,836.00	
25002300	TEMPORARY SEEDING	ACRE	12.3	\$100.00	\$1,230.00		\$400.00	\$4,920.00		\$200.00	\$2,460.00	
25100115	MULCH, METHOD 2	ACRE	2.7	\$1,700.00	\$4,590.00		\$1,000.00	\$2,700.00		\$1,800.00	\$4,860.00	
25100630	EROSION CONTROL BLANKET	SQ YD	23,957	\$0.95	\$22,759.15		\$1.14	\$27,310.98		\$1.00	\$23,957.00	
25100635	HEAVY DUTY EROSION CONTROL BLANKET	SQ YD	6,731	\$1.25	\$8,413.75		\$1.80	\$12,115.80		\$1.30	\$8,750.30	
28000400	PERIMETER EROSION BARRIER	FOOT	7,996	\$1.50	\$11,994.00		\$2.00	\$15,992.00		\$1.75	\$13,993.00	
28100107	STONE RIPRAP, CLASS A4	SQ YD	541	\$50.00	\$27,050.00		\$50.00	\$27,050.00		\$70.00	\$37,870.00	
35101800	AGGREGATE BASE COURSE, TYPE B 6"	SQ YD	413	\$9.50	\$3,923.50		\$13.00	\$5,369.00		\$11.00	\$4,543.00	
40600100	BITUMINOUS MATERIALS (PRIME COAT)	GALLON	206	\$4.00	\$824.00		\$2.25	\$463.50		\$5.00	\$1,030.00	
40603310	HOT-MIX ASPHALT SURFACE COURSE, MIX	TON	46	\$230.00	\$10,580.00		\$200.00	\$9,200.00		\$220.00	\$10,120.00	
44000200	DRIVEWAY PAVEMENT REMOVAL	SQ YD	1,503	\$1.00	\$1,503.00		\$12.00	\$18,036.00		\$5.00	\$7,515.00	
50300225	CONCRETE STRUCTURES	CU YD	77.6	\$500.00	\$38,800.00		\$500.00	\$38,800.00		\$860.00	\$66,736.00	
50300255	CONCRETE SUPERSTRUCTURE	CU YD	349.9	\$745.00	\$260,675.50		\$500.00	\$174,950.00		\$560.00	\$195,944.00	

50300260	BRIDGE DECK GROOVING	SQ YD	808	\$5.75	\$4,646.00	\$4.50	\$3,636.00	\$8.10	\$6,544.80
50300280	CONCRETE ENCASEMENT	CU YD	7.7	\$1,250.00	\$9,625.00	\$900.00	\$6,930.00	\$860.00	\$6,622.00
50300300	PROTECTIVE COAT	SQ YD	924	\$3.00	\$2,772.00	\$1.00	\$924.00	\$4.00	\$3,696.00
50401105	FURNISHING AND ERECTING PRECAST PRESTRESS	FOOT	894	\$180.00	\$160,920.00	\$160.00	\$143,040.00	\$200.00	\$178,800.00
50800205	REINFORCEMENT BARS, EPOXY COATED	POUND	88,220	\$1.10	\$97,042.00	\$1.00	\$88,220.00	\$1.10	\$97,042.00
50800515	BAR SPLICERS	EACH	118	\$25.00	\$2,950.00	\$22.00	\$2,596.00	\$31.00	\$3,658.00
51201600	FURNISHING STEEL PILES HP12X53	FOOT	784	\$70.00	\$54,880.00	\$56.00	\$43,984.00	\$42.00	\$32,928.00
51202305	DRIVING PILES	FOOT	784	\$1.00	\$784.00	\$1.00	\$784.00	\$1.00	\$784.00
51203600	TEST PILE STEEL HP12X53	EACH	2	\$10,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$3,500.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,600.00	\$15,200.00
51500100	NAME PLATES	EACH	1	\$650.00	\$650.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$520.00	\$520.00
54213657	PRECAST REINFORCED CONCRETE FLARED END	EACH	1	\$475.00	\$475.00	\$300.00	\$300.00	\$420.00	\$420.00
54213660	PRECAST REINFORCED CONCRETE FLARED END	EACH	1	\$550.00	\$550.00	\$300.00	\$300.00	\$420.00	\$420.00
550A0340	STORM SEWERS, CLASS A, TYPE 2 12"	FOOT	94	\$42.00	\$3,948.00	\$40.00	\$3,760.00	\$37.00	\$3,478.00
550A0360	STORM SEWERS, CLASS A, TYPE 2 15"	FOOT	48	\$47.00	\$2,256.00	\$42.00	\$2,016.00	\$39.00	\$1,872.00
550A0540	STORM SEWERS, CLASS A, TYPE 3 12"	FOOT	63	\$55.00	\$3,465.00	\$40.00	\$2,520.00	\$37.00	\$2,331.00
550A1550	STORM SEWERS, CLASS A, TYPE 6 15"	FOOT	82	\$60.00	\$4,920.00	\$42.00	\$3,444.00	\$39.00	\$3,198.00
55100500	STORM SEWER REMOVAL 12"	FOOT	25	\$10.00	\$250.00	\$20.00	\$500.00	\$30.00	\$750.00
59100100	GEOCOMPOSITE WALL DRAIN	SQ YD	132	\$12.00	\$1,584.00	\$25.00	\$3,300.00	\$21.00	\$2,772.00
60109580	PIPE UNDERDRAINS FOR STRUCTURES 4"	FOOT	227	\$28.00	\$6,356.00	\$20.00	\$4,540.00	\$19.00	\$4,313.00
60201340	CATCH BASINS, TYPE A, 4'-DIAMETER, TYPE 2	EACH	3	\$2,240.00	\$6,720.00	\$2,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$1,700.00	\$5,100.00
60218400	MANHOLES, TYPE A, 4'-DIAMETER, TYPE 1	EACH	1	\$4,452.00	\$4,452.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
60219000	MANHOLES, TYPE A, 4'-DIAMETER, TYPE 8	EACH	1	\$1,751.00	\$1,751.00	\$2,600.00	\$2,600.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
60223800	MANHOLES, TYPE A, 6'-DIAMETER, TYPE 1	EACH	1	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$9,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$5,500.00	\$5,500.00
67000400	ENGINEER'S FIELD OFFICE, TYPE A	CAL MO	6	\$2,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$3,600.00	\$21,600.00	\$3,725.00	\$22,350.00
67100100	MOBILIZATION	L SUM	1	\$58,000.00	\$58,000.00	\$103,230.00	\$103,230.00	\$221,120.10	\$221,120.10
70101700	TRAFFIC CONTROL AND PROTECTION	L SUM	1	\$4,890.00	\$4,890.00	\$12,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
X0322671	STABILIZED CONSTRUCTION ENTRANCE	SQ YD	1,500	\$5.50	\$8,250.00	\$12.00	\$18,000.00	\$0.01	\$15.00
XX004094	CONCRETE SLOPEWALL	SQ FT	5,163	\$15.00	\$77,445.00	\$14.00	\$72,282.00	\$13.00	\$67,119.00
XX006821	CONCRETE TRUCK WASHOUT	L SUM	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$3,200.00	\$3,200.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
XXXXXX	SEDIMENT BASIN DEWATERING STRUCTURE	EACH	2	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$11,000.00	\$22,000.00
Z0007124	STEEL RAILING (SPECIAL)	FOOT	262	\$125.00	\$32,750.00	\$162.00	\$42,444.00	\$175.00	\$45,850.00
Z0013300	CONCRETE REMOVAL (SPECIAL)	SQ YD	269	\$6.00	\$1,614.00	\$22.00	\$5,918.00	\$15.00	\$4,035.00
Z0019600	DUST CONTROL WATERING	UNIT	300	\$15.00	\$4,500.00	\$14.00	\$4,200.00	\$80.00	\$24,000.00
Z0022800	FENCE REMOVAL	FOOT	358	\$3.65	\$1,306.70	\$3.00	\$1,074.00	\$4.00	\$1,432.00

IHC Construction Co.			Illinois Constructors			Siosstrom & Sons			EarthWerks		
Bidder 4	\$2,024,011.84		Bidder 5	\$2,265,127.64		Bidder 6	\$2,288,882.04		Bidder 7	\$2,944,854.24	
Auth Total			Auth Total			Auth Total			Auth Total		
Price	Amount		Price	Amount		Price	Amount		Price	Amount	
\$4,500.00	\$19,350.00		\$4,500.00	\$19,350.00		\$8,370.00	\$35,991.00		\$4,500.00	\$19,350.00	
\$4.95	\$27,225.00		\$3.25	\$17,875.00		\$2.20	\$12,100.00		\$2.00	\$11,000.00	
\$75.00	\$7,500.00		\$75.00	\$7,500.00		\$200.00	\$20,000.00		\$75.00	\$7,500.00	
\$65.00	\$6,500.00		\$65.00	\$6,500.00		\$30.00	\$3,000.00		\$65.00	\$6,500.00	
\$90.00	\$9,000.00		\$90.00	\$9,000.00		\$107.50	\$10,750.00		\$90.00	\$9,000.00	
\$3.00	\$8,564.00		\$5.30	\$85,796.40		\$2.80	\$45,326.40		\$10.00	\$161,880.00	
\$10.25	\$611,115.25		\$15.50	\$924,125.50		\$13.00	\$775,073.00		\$24.00	\$1,430,904.00	
\$45.00	\$13,410.00		\$24.00	\$7,152.00		\$34.00	\$10,132.00		\$25.00	\$7,450.00	
\$36.50	\$1,423.50		\$40.00	\$1,560.00		\$40.00	\$1,560.00		\$25.00	\$975.00	
\$5.65	\$58,771.30		\$8.50	\$88,417.00		\$7.50	\$78,015.00		\$5.00	\$52,010.00	
\$1,200.00	\$240.00		\$1,200.00	\$240.00		\$3,000.00	\$600.00		\$1,000.00	\$200.00	
\$1,200.00	\$10,320.00		\$1,200.00	\$10,320.00		\$1,550.00	\$13,330.00		\$3,000.00	\$25,800.00	
\$1,987.00	\$2,781.80		\$1,987.00	\$2,781.80		\$2,700.00	\$3,780.00		\$3,500.00	\$4,900.00	
\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$2.00	\$1,836.00		\$1.00	\$918.00	
\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$2.00	\$1,836.00		\$1.00	\$918.00	
\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$1.34	\$1,230.12		\$2.00	\$1,836.00		\$1.00	\$918.00	
\$400.00	\$4,920.00		\$400.00	\$4,920.00		\$700.00	\$8,610.00		\$500.00	\$6,150.00	
\$1,000.00	\$2,700.00		\$1,000.00	\$2,700.00		\$1,350.00	\$3,645.00		\$1,500.00	\$4,050.00	
\$1.14	\$27,310.98		\$1.14	\$27,310.98		\$1.00	\$23,957.00		\$1.20	\$28,748.40	
\$1.80	\$12,115.80		\$1.80	\$12,115.80		\$1.70	\$11,442.70		\$4.00	\$26,924.00	
\$2.00	\$15,992.00		\$2.00	\$15,992.00		\$2.10	\$16,791.60		\$1.50	\$11,994.00	
\$31.56	\$17,073.96		\$65.00	\$35,165.00		\$64.70	\$35,002.70		\$45.00	\$24,345.00	
\$6.75	\$2,787.75		\$5.00	\$2,065.00		\$12.00	\$4,956.00		\$6.00	\$2,478.00	
\$0.01	\$2.06		\$2.25	\$463.50		\$2.00	\$412.00		\$2.00	\$412.00	
\$260.58	\$11,986.68		\$120.00	\$5,520.00		\$250.00	\$11,500.00		\$90.00	\$4,140.00	
\$1.00	\$1,503.00		\$2.00	\$3,006.00		\$7.00	\$10,521.00		\$3.00	\$4,509.00	
\$650.00	\$50,440.00		\$740.00	\$57,424.00		\$857.50	\$66,542.00		\$600.00	\$46,560.00	
\$850.00	\$297,415.00		\$425.00	\$148,707.50		\$696.65	\$243,757.84		\$450.00	\$157,455.00	

\$7.68	\$6,205.44	\$6.35	\$5,130.80	\$7.90	\$6,383.20	\$4.00	\$3,232.00
\$490.00	\$3,773.00	\$880.00	\$6,776.00	\$1,558.00	\$11,996.60	\$800.00	\$6,160.00
\$1.50	\$1,386.00	\$1.50	\$1,386.00	\$2.70	\$2,494.80	\$1.25	\$1,155.00
\$179.20	\$160,204.80	\$255.00	\$227,970.00	\$185.00	\$165,390.00	\$385.00	\$344,190.00
\$0.95	\$83,809.00	\$1.10	\$97,042.00	\$1.10	\$97,042.00	\$1.00	\$88,220.00
\$25.00	\$2,950.00	\$30.00	\$3,540.00	\$26.50	\$3,127.00	\$25.00	\$2,950.00
\$61.00	\$47,824.00	\$78.00	\$61,152.00	\$62.10	\$48,686.40	\$48.00	\$37,632.00
\$46.00	\$36,064.00	\$1.00	\$784.00	\$1.00	\$784.00	\$0.01	\$7.84
\$4,500.00	\$9,000.00	\$11,200.00	\$22,400.00	\$8,299.60	\$16,599.20	\$12,500.00	\$25,000.00
\$750.00	\$750.00	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$577.20	\$577.20	\$400.00	\$400.00
\$495.36	\$495.36	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$886.20	\$886.20	\$650.00	\$650.00
\$573.56	\$573.58	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$974.80	\$974.80	\$750.00	\$750.00
\$43.80	\$4,117.20	\$45.00	\$4,230.00	\$88.60	\$8,328.40	\$25.00	\$2,350.00
\$49.02	\$2,352.96	\$85.00	\$4,080.00	\$88.60	\$4,252.80	\$28.00	\$1,344.00
\$57.36	\$3,613.68	\$55.00	\$3,465.00	\$88.60	\$5,581.80	\$26.00	\$1,638.00
\$62.57	\$5,130.74	\$110.00	\$9,020.00	\$132.90	\$10,897.80	\$30.00	\$2,460.00
\$10.43	\$260.75	\$20.00	\$500.00	\$10.00	\$250.00	\$10.00	\$250.00
\$28.00	\$3,696.00	\$23.00	\$3,036.00	\$28.20	\$3,722.40	\$14.00	\$1,848.00
\$43.80	\$9,942.60	\$19.00	\$4,313.00	\$25.00	\$5,675.00	\$20.00	\$4,540.00
\$2,336.03	\$7,008.09	\$2,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$1,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$1,000.00	\$3,000.00
\$4,642.86	\$4,642.86	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00
\$1,826.07	\$1,826.07	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
\$17,207.37	\$17,207.37	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00
\$2,980.00	\$17,880.00	\$1,800.00	\$10,800.00	\$2,443.10	\$14,658.60	\$2,000.00	\$12,000.00
\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$142,000.00	\$142,000.00	\$154,000.00	\$154,000.00
\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$8,950.00	\$8,950.00	\$7,400.00	\$7,400.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00
\$17.50	\$26,250.00	\$15.00	\$22,500.00	\$12.50	\$18,750.00	\$10.00	\$15,000.00
\$16.50	\$85,189.50	\$9.00	\$46,467.00	\$16.00	\$82,608.00	\$11.00	\$56,793.00
\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$4,800.00	\$4,800.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00
\$1,150.00	\$2,300.00	\$3,800.00	\$7,600.00	\$50,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00
\$198.55	\$52,020.10	\$175.00	\$45,850.00	\$169.80	\$44,487.60	\$200.00	\$52,400.00
\$6.00	\$1,614.00	\$10.00	\$2,690.00	\$5.00	\$1,345.00	\$10.00	\$2,690.00
\$53.85	\$16,155.00	\$1.00	\$300.00	\$16.70	\$5,010.00	\$100.00	\$30,000.00
\$7.35	\$2,631.30	\$6.00	\$2,148.00	\$15.00	\$5,370.00	\$7.00	\$2,506.00

June 30, 2011

Mr. Mark Koenen, P.E.  
Director of Public Works  
City of St. Charles  
200 Devereaux Way  
St. Charles, IL 60174

Attention: Mr. James Bernahl, P.E.  
Public Works Engineering Manager

Subject: CONTRACT BID REVIEW  
Red Gate Road Extension over the Fox River – Advance Contract  
Benesch Reference No. 10092

Dear Mr. Koenen:

We have reviewed the bid tabulation for the above contract and offer the following observations:

- The average of the seven bids is \$2,167,300.58 which is about 21% less than the Engineer's Estimate of \$2,739,317.50.
- The apparent low bidder, Herlihy Mid-Continent, submitted a bid of \$1,651,718.23, which was 40% under the Engineer's Estimate. Also, the lowest bid is 17.28% lower than the next bidder and 63.9% lower than the highest bidder.
- The Engineer's Estimate was prepared using 2009/2010 unit prices. Although the unit prices were trending lower because of market conditions, the estimate maintained the with conservative unit prices to assure that enough programming funds were available in case market conditions changed.

Bid prices were submitted for 62 items. The following are line items with significant variances from the Engineer's Estimate:

- 20200100 – Earth Excavation. The low bidder's amount is \$129,504.00 lower than the Engineer's estimate or a variance of 27.27%. There was a significant variance between bidders with a minimum amount of \$45,326.40 and a maximum amount of \$169,974.00. The average unit price is \$5.59, which is 51% of the Engineer's Estimate. The low bidder's amount is 53.7% of the average amount for all bids. The variance could be due to a difference in equipment costs for contractor's that own the heavy equipment necessary for a major earthwork operation and those who must rent equipment.
- 20400800 – Furnished Excavation. The low bidder's total for this item is \$417,943.21 lower than the Engineer's. As with the previous item, there is a significant variance between bidders. The minimum amount was \$476,371.79 and the maximum amount was \$1,430,904.00. The average unit price is \$12.91 or 86% of the Engineer's Estimate. The low bidder's amount is 61.9% of the average amount for all bids. The variance for this item is also likely due to differences in equipment costs as well as the low bidder may have negotiated a favorable deal for material supply. Please note that the low bidder (Herlihy) and his subcontractor (Bell Land Development) are also the combination that constructed few sections of the Stearns Road Corridor which had similar scope of work to this contract. This may have allowed them to reduce the unit price on this item because of their lower level of uncertainty with the process and the local area.

- 21101505 – Topsoil Excavation and Placement. The low bidder's amount is \$47,641.16 lower than the Engineer's Estimate. As with previous items, there is a significant variance between bidders. The minimum amount was \$52,010.00 and the maximum amount was \$135,226.00. The average unit price is \$7.92 or 75.4% of the Engineer's Estimate. The low bidder's amount is 74.7% of the average amount for all bids. As with other earth work activities, the variance for this item is likely due to differences in equipment costs.
- 25100635 – Heavy Duty Erosion Control Blanket. The Low Bidder's amount is \$58,896.25 lower than the Engineer's Estimate for this item. The average unit price for this item is \$1.95. The low bidder's amount is 64.1% of the average contributory amount. The unit prices between bidders showed little variance with a minimum unit price of \$1.25 and a maximum unit price of \$4.00. The difference in amount between the Engineer's Estimate and the low bidder can be attributed to variability of material costs between suppliers.
- 20100500 – Tree Removal, Acres. The low bidder's amount is \$38,915.00 below the Engineer's Estimate for this item. The average unit price for this item is \$5,381.43 or a variance of 41.85% from the low bidder. The difference in amount between the Engineer's Estimate and the low bidder can be attributed to more competitive equipment costs.
- 67100100 - Mobilization. The low bidder's amount is \$96,000.00 below the Engineer's Estimate for this item. There was a significant variance in amount between bidders with a minimum amount of \$58,000.00 and a maximum amount of \$221,120.10. The average unit price is \$130,478.59 or 85% of the Engineer's Estimate. The low bidder's amount is 44.5% of the average amount for all bids. The variance could be due to differences in the proximity of the contractors' equipment storage facilities to the project site and the fact that they are working on the Stearns Road Corridor.
- X0322671 – Stabilized Construction Entrance. The low bidder's amount is \$35,250.00 below the Engineer's Estimate. The average unit price for this item is \$10.36 or a variance of 35.72% from the Engineer's Estimate. The difference in amount between the Engineer's Estimate and the low bidder can be attributed to more competitive equipment costs and lower material costs.
- Z0013300 – Concrete Removal, Special. The low bidder's amount is \$29,186.50 lower than the Engineer's Estimate. The average unit price for this item is \$10.57 or a variance of 9.23% from the Engineer's Estimate. The difference in amount between the Engineer's Estimate and the low bidder can be attributed to more competitive equipment costs and material disposal costs.
- 25000210 - Seeding, Class 2A. The low bidder's amount is \$23,435.00 lower than the Engineer's Estimate. There was a significant variance in amount between bidders with a minimum amount of \$6,665.00 and a maximum amount of \$25,800.00. The average unit price is \$1,403.57 or 40% of the Engineer's Estimate. The low bidder's amount is 55.2% of the average amount for all bids. The variance could be due to a difference in equipment costs and in material costs. The item has a higher quantity than similar activities included in the contract allowing contractors to obtain materials in large volume and at a discounted cost.
- 51201600 - Furnishing Steel Piles HP 12x53 - The low bidder's amount is \$23,520.00 higher than the Engineer's estimate or a variance of 175%. The average unit price is \$59.59 or 148.96% of the Engineer's Estimate. The low bidder's amount is 117.5% of the average contributory amount for all bids. The variance from the Engineer's Estimate could be due to the small quantity of piles compared to the mobilization of the driving equipment.





Outside of these items, either the variance in bids is not unreasonable or the bid prices of the other pay items are insignificant to affect the overall analysis of the bid. In addition, the current state of the economy is significantly impacting bid prices. The economic downturn has created a more competitive market where contractors are preparing estimates with tighter margins in order to secure work. Also, the fact that Herlihy is working on several sections of the Stearns Road Corridor may have allowed them to reduce their overall bid for this contract.

We feel that market conditions are still resulting in unexpectedly low, aggressive and competitive bids due to the scarcity of transportation projects. The end result is total bid prices below the Engineer's Estimate, which will help the City meet its cost-saving goal.

We have worked with Herlihy and Bell Land Development in the past, and find them to be cooperative and timely, with their work done in accordance with plans and specifications.

Accordingly, Alfred Benesch & Company recommends that the City accept the low bid of Herlihy Mid-Continent Co.

If you have any questions or comments, please don't hesitate to call me.

Sincerely,

Hossam M. Abdou, Ph.D., P.E., S.E.  
Vice President/Project Manager

HMA:hma